477925.1

WATANABE ING LLP

A Limited Liability Law Partnership

J. DOUGLAS ING

#1538-0

BRIAN A. KANG

#6495-0

ROSS T. SHINYAMA

#8830-0

SUMMER H. KAIAWE

#9599-0

First Hawaiian Center

999 Bishop Street, Suite 1250

Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Telephone No.: (808) 544-8300

Facsimile No.: (808) 544-8399

douging@wik.com

bkang@wik.com

rshinyama@wik.com

skaiawe@wik.com

Attorneys for

TMT INTERNATIONAL OBSERVATORY, LLC

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Kaohe Mauka, Hamakua District, Island of Hawaii, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009

CASE NO. BLNR-CC-16-002

PROPOSED MINUTE ORDER NO. (ORDER DENYING MOTION TO BRING ON REBUTTAL WITNESS ON BEHALF OF KEALOHA PISCIOTTA AND MAUNA KEA ANAINA HOU FILED ON FEBRUARY 13, 2017 (DOC NO. 462)); CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

PROPOSED MINUTE ORDER NO. (ORDER DENYING MOTION TO BRING ON REBUTTAL WITNESS ON BEHALF OF KEALOHA PISCIOTTA AND MAUNA KEA ANAINA HOU FILED ON FEBRUARY 13, 2017 (DOC. NO. 462))

On February 21, 2017, the "Motion to Bring on Rebuttal Witness[es] on behalf of Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou" filed on February 13, 2017 (Doc. No. 462) (the "Motion"), was heard in Hilo, Hawai'i, at the Grand Naniloa Hotel, Crown Room, 93 Banyan Drive. The following persons were present at the hearing on the Motion:

Ian Sandison, Esq. and John Pete Manaut, Esq.; Attorneys for the University of Hawai'i at Hilo

Kealoha Pisciotta, for herself, Mauna Kea Anaina Hou, and Paul K. Neves Dexter Kaiama, Esq. for KAHEA: The Environmental Alliance Clarence Kūkauakahi Ching

Harry Fergerstrom

J. Douglas Ing, Esq. and Jeffrey T. Ono, Esq.; Attorneys for TMT International Observatory, LLC

Vaughn Cook, Esq.; Attorney for Perpetuating Unique Educational Opportunities; Mehana Kihoi, for herself, and Leina'ala Sleightholm

Dwight Vicente

Cindy Freitas

William Freitas

In addition to the Motion, the following written submissions were considered:

DOC.	TITLE	PARTY
467	KAHEA: The Environmental Alliance's Joinder in Motion to Bring Rebuttal Witness on Behalf of Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou filed February 13, 2017	KAHEA: The Environmental Alliance
468	TMT International Observatory, LLC's Memorandum in Opposition to "Motion to Bring on Rebuttal Witness[es] on Behalf of Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou" [Doc-462]	TMT International Observatory, LLC
470	The University of Hawai'i at Hilo's Joinder to TMT International Observatory, LLC's Opposition to Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou's Motion to Bring on Rebuttal Witness on Behalf of Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou, dated February 13, 2017	University of Hawai'i at Hilo

Based on the Motion, the written submissions, the oral argument presented at the hearing on the Motion, and the entire records and files herein, the Hearing Officer finds that the rebuttal testimony of Kupuna Liko Martin and Mr. Tom Peek would be cumulative in nature, immaterial, and that no good cause has been shown as to why these witnesses were not presented during Ms. Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou's case in chief.

In addition, to the extent Kupuna Liko Martin and Mr. Tom Peek watched the contested case proceeding and wished to contest what other witnesses said, and therefore requested to be a rebuttal witness, the Hearing Officer finds that this is not a basis to allow the rebuttal testimony.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the Motion is DENIED.

DATED: H	onolulu, Hawaii,	
	Judge Riki May Amano (Ret.)	
	Hearing Officer	

BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

FOR THE STATE OF HAWAI'I

IN THE MATTER OF

Case No. BLNR-CC-16-002

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

A Contested Case Hearing Re Conservation District Use Permit (CDUP) HA-3568 for the Thirty Meter Telescope at the Mauna Kea Science Reserve, Kaohe Mauka, Hamakua District, Island of Hawaii, TMK (3) 4-4-015:009

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that the foregoing document was served upon the

following parties by the means indicated:

Michael Cain
Office of Conservation and
Coastal Lands
1151 Punchbowl, Room 131
Honolulu, HI 96813
michael.cain@hawaii.gov
Custodian of the Records
(ORIGINAL + DIGITAL
COPY)

Carlsmith Ball LLP
Ian Sandison, Tim Lui-Kwan,
John P. Manaut, Lindsay N.
McAneeley
1001 Bishop Street
ASB Tower, Suite 2200
Honolulu, HI 96813
isandison@carlsmith.com
tluikwan@carlsmith.com
jpm@carlsmith.com
lmcaneeley@carlsmith.com
Counsel for the Applicant
University of Hawai i at Hilo

Office of Conservation and M Coastal Lands PC dlnr.maunakea@hawaii.gov He

Harry Fergerstrom P.O. Box 951 Kurtistown, HI 96760 hankhawaiian@yahoo.com (via email & U.S. mail)

Lanny Alan Sinkin
P. O. Box 944
Hilo, HI 96721
lanny.sinkin@gmail.com
Representative for The Temple
of Lono

J. Leina'ala Sleightholm P.O. Box 383035 Waikoloa, HI 96738 leinaala.mauna@gmail.com Mehana Kihoi PO Box 393 Honaunau, HI 96726 uhiwai@live.com

C. M. Kaho'okahi Kanuha 77-6504 Maile St Kailua Kona, HI 96740 **Kahookahi.kukiaimauna@gmail.com**

Maelani Lee PO Box 1054 Waianae, HI 96792 maelanilee@yahoo.com

Kalikolehua Kanaele 4 Spring Street Hilo, HI 96720 akulele@yahoo.com

Torkildson, Katz, Moore,
Hetherington & Harris
Attn: Lincoln S. T. Ashida
120 Pauahi Street, Suite 312
Hilo, HI 96720-3084
lsa@torkildson.com
njc@torkildson.com
Counsel for Perpetuating
Unique Educational
Opportunities (PUEO)
William Freitas

(via email & U.S. mail)

Stephanie-Malia: Tabbada P O Box 194, Naalehu, HI 96772 s.tabbada@hawaiiantel.net

Brannon Kamahana Kealoha 89-564 Mokiawe Street Nanakuli, HI 96792 brannonk@hawaii.edu

Dwight J. Vicente

2608 Ainaola Drive

Hilo, Hawaiian Kingdom

dwightjvicente@gmail.com

Joseph Kualii Lindsey Camara kualiic@hotmail.com

PO Box 4650 Kailua Kona, HI 96745 pohaku7@yahoo.com

Cindy Freitas PO Box 4650 Kailua Kona, HI 96745 hanahanai@hawaii.rr.com

Wilma H. Holi P.O. Box 368 Hanapepe, HI 96716 w holi@hotmail.com lehina@hawaii.rr.com Witness for the Hearing Officer (via email U.S. mail)

Flores-Case 'Ohana E. Kalani Flores ekflores@hawaiiantel.net

Glen Kila 89-530 Mokiawe Street Waianae, HI 96792 makakila@gmail.com

Ivy McIntosh 3popoki@gmail.com Witness for the Hearing Officer

Tiffnie Kakalia 549 E. Kahaopea St. Hilo, HI 96720 tiffniekakalia@gmail.com B. Pualani Case puacase@hawaiiantel.net Moses Kealamakia Jr. mkealama@yahoo.com Witness for the Hearing Officer

Paul K. Neves kealiikea@yahoo.com

Deborah J. Ward

Clarence Kukauakahi Ching kahiwaL@cs.com

Patricia P. Ikeda pheakeanila@gmail.com Witness for the Hearing Officer

Kealoha Pisciotta and Mauna Kea Anaina Hou keomaivg@gmail.com

cordylinecolor@gmail.com

Yuklin Aluli, Esq. 415-C Uluniu Street Kailua, Hawaii 96734 yuklin@kailualaw.com Co-Counsel for Petitioner KAHEA: The Hawaiian Environmental Alliance, a domestic non-profit Corporation

Dexter K. Kaiama, Esq. 111 Hekili Street, #A1607 Kailua, Hawaii 96734 cdexk@hotmail.com Co-Counsel for Petitioner KAHEA: The Hawaiian Environmental Alliance, a domestic non-profit Corporation

DATED: Honolulu, Hawaii, February 24, 2017.

J. DOUGLAS ING BRIAN A. KANG ROSS T. SHINYAMA SUMMER H. KAIAWE

Attorneys for TMT INTERNATIONAL

OBSERVATORY, LLC